

SCHOLARS AT RISK

N E T W O R K

 protection  advocacy  learning

**Scholars at Risk's Submission to the Third Cycle of
Universal Periodic Review of Turkey 35th Session of the
United Nations Human Rights Council
to be held in January 2020**

Scholars at Risk
411 Lafayette St., 3rd Floor
New York, NY 10003
United States
Tel: 1-212-998-2179
Email: scholarsatrisk@nyu.edu

Introduction

1. Scholars at Risk (SAR) is an international network of higher education institutions dedicated to protecting threatened scholars and promoting academic freedom worldwide. Since 2013, SAR has benefited from Special Consultative Status with ECOSOC, and welcomes the opportunity, provided by the Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights, to comment on conditions relating to higher education in Turkey.
2. This submission is the product of a joint effort between Scholars at Risk's Academic Freedom Monitoring Project and the legal clinic of the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University, Belgium. SAR gratefully acknowledges the substantial research and drafting work of Ghent faculty and students. This submission may not reflect the views of the Human Rights Centre, Ghent University, Ghent faculty and students, or individual Scholars at Risk Network members, institutions, or participating individuals.
3. This submission focuses on Turkey's compliance with its obligations under international law to protect and promote academic freedom and related rights within its territory. Since 2016, scholars, students, and higher education institutions in Turkey have faced an unparalleled volume of pressures, including mass arrests, criminal investigations, terminations, closures of universities, and restrictions on travel. These actions have profoundly impacted the entire Turkish higher education sector, not only harming thousands of individuals, but the country's university space overall. SAR urges Turkish authorities to take every available action to reverse the course and ensure that academic freedom and related values are protected going forward.

Applicable Legal Standards

4. Turkey is bound by several applicable international human rights instruments, including the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), the International Covenant on Social, Economic and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), and the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ECHR).
5. Academic freedom is independently and interdependently grounded in the rights to freedom of opinion and expression and the right to education, as articulated, respectively, in ICCPR Article 19 and ICESCR Article 13, and other international instruments. Violations of academic freedom also frequently manifest as violations of other rights, including liberty and security of person, freedom of movement, freedom of assembly, and freedom of association.¹
6. Article 19, of the ICCPR, to which Turkey is a party, guarantees "the freedom to seek, receive, and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers, either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of art, or through any other media of his choice." ECHR Article 10 compliments this provision. The European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) has on several occasions recognised the importance of academic freedom,² and acknowledged the chilling effect that results from sanctions on the exercise thereof.³

7. Article 13 of the ICESCR, to which Turkey is a party, and Article 2 of Protocol No. 1, ECHR provide for the right to education. Under Article 13, states “recognize the right of everyone to education” and “agree that education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and the sense of its dignity and shall strengthen the respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms,” and that education “enable[s] all persons to participate effectively in a free society.” In this regard, the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights has recognised that the right to education “can only be enjoyed if accompanied by the academic freedom of staff and students.”⁴
8. Article 15(3) of the ICESCR requires State parties to “respect the freedom indispensable for scientific research and creative activity.” This “indispensable freedom” not only excludes censorship, but also imposes a positive obligation on State parties to encourage “scientists, artists and others to take part in international scientific and cultural research activities.”⁵
9. UNESCO defines academic freedom to include institutional autonomy. As described by the UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel (1997), “Autonomy is the institutional form of academic freedom and a necessary precondition to guarantee the proper fulfilment of the functions entrusted to higher-education teaching personnel and institutions... Member States are under an obligation to protect higher education institutions from threats to their autonomy coming from any source.”⁶ Turkey is an executive board member of UNESCO. These standards are echoed by the Council of Europe,⁷ of which Turkey is also a member.

Legal Background and Context

10. For more than 70 years, Turkish law has recognized academic freedom and related rights. Administrative and academic autonomy were officially granted to universities in 1946, and affirmed by the State Constitution in 1960.⁸ In 1982, explicit protections for academic freedom were included in the State Constitution, which recognizes the right to “study and teach, express, and disseminate science and the arts, and to carry out research in these fields freely.”⁹
11. Despite these and other legal protections, Turkey’s use of anti-terrorism laws and related provisions to limit free expression, including academic expression, has long been a source of concern.¹⁰ During Turkey’s last UPR cycle, states recommended, *inter alia*, that Turkey “[s]trengthen protections for the freedom of expression by allowing discourse and greater access to information... and ensure the penal code and anti-terror laws are consistent with international obligations.”¹¹
12. Although Turkey supported these recommendations, Turkey’s broadly worded Anti-Terror Law continues to be used as the basis for actions against scholars and students. Article 7(2) of the law provides that “any person who disseminates propaganda in favour of a terrorist organisation by justifying, praising or encouraging the use of methods constituting coercion, violence or threats shall be liable to a term of imprisonment of one to five years...”¹² While the law was reformed in 2013, Council of Europe authorities have found those reforms “clearly insufficient [as the law continues to] provide for excessive sanctions and ha[s] been applied too widely,

penalising conduct protected under the ECHR, in particular its Article 10 and the related case-law as well as conduct protected under Article 19 ICCPR.”¹³

13. Similarly, broadly worded provisions in the Turkish Penal Code, including especially Article 301 prohibiting insulting the Turkish nation, state and institutions and organs of government, are used as a basis for retaliating for the exercise of academic freedom and related rights, triggering repeated criticism from the ECtHR, among others.¹⁴

Mass Targeting of Higher Education

14. Turkey’s unprecedented attacks on scholars, students and higher education institutions in Turkey can be linked to two significant events.
15. On January 11, 2016, a group of scholars known as Academics for Peace released a petition (the Peace Petition) demanding an end to fighting between the Turkish State and members of the Kurdistan Workers’ Party; accusing the government of the “deliberate massacre and deportation” of civilians; and calling on the government to allow independent observers into the region, end curfews, and renew peace talks.¹⁵ The petition was initially signed by 1,128 academics from 89 Turkish universities, and more than 300 scholars from outside Turkey. (The total number of signatories eventually reached 2,212.) Immediately after its publication, Turkish authorities initiated sweeping measures against the signatories, including placing all of them under investigation, laying the groundwork for hundreds of dismissals, arrests, prosecutions and imprisonments, which continue as of this report.¹⁶
16. Following a July 15, 2016 coup attempt, pressures on the higher education sector worsened severely. On July 20, 2016, Turkish authorities declared a state of emergency under which future emergency decrees would carry the force of law. Claiming, without disclosing any evidentiary basis, that the exiled Muslim cleric Fethullah Gülen and members of his movement (Gülenists) were behind the coup attempt, the government initiated thousands of official actions aimed at purging Gülenists from public sector institutions, including, in relevant part, higher education institutions throughout the country.¹⁷
17. Together, these anti-Peace Petition and anti-Gülenist actions have resulted in unparalleled pressures on scholars, students, and higher education across Turkey. During this UPR cycle, SAR’s Academic Freedom Monitoring Project has captured more than 285 attacks on higher education in Turkey, nearly triple the number of attacks documented in any other country during the same period. These include imprisonments, prosecutions, investigations, terminations, restrictions on travel, and closures of universities, collectively affecting more than 10,000 scholars and higher education personnel, and more than 58,000 students.

Prosecutions and Imprisonments

Peace Petition Signatories

18. Since being placed under investigation in January 2016, hundreds of Peace Petition signatories have been charged, in nearly uniform indictments, with “making propaganda for a terrorist organization” in violation of Article 7(2) of the Anti-Terror

Law.¹⁸ Even under the law's broad scope, these charges are improper, as the clear language of the petition does not justify, praise or encourage acts of coercion, violence or threats; rather the petition objects to such conduct, albeit by the state.

19. From December 2017 through June 2019, more than 630 of these cases have reportedly been brought to trial. Of those, 200 have concluded, all resulting in guilty verdicts and prison sentences ranging from fifteen months to three years.¹⁹ In most of these cases, the courts suspended the announcement of the verdict, allowing defendants to avoid prison time, so long as they are not subsequently convicted of separate crimes.²⁰ In at least 35 cases to date, however, Peace Petition signatory defendants face imprisonment.²¹ These include,²² among others:

- **Zübeyde Füsün Üstel**, a Galatasaray University professor ordered on April 4, 2018 to serve a fifteen-month sentence, because she allegedly “failed to express remorse” for her alleged crime.²³
- **Büşra Ersanlı**, a Marmara University political science professor who had previously been arrested in connection with her activism, ordered on June 5, 2018 to serve a fifteen-month sentence.²⁴
- **Yonca Demir**, an Istanbul Bilgi University lecturer, ordered on January 24, 2019 to serve three years in prison. His sentence was the longest imposed for signing the Petition.²⁵

Alleged Coup-Attempt Cases

20. Turkish authorities also arrested, charged, and prosecuted hundreds of scholars based on specious allegations that they were associated with the Gülenist movement, and therefore involved with the coup attempt. Beyond being based on unproved allegations of Gülenist involvement in the coup attempt, the government's guilt-by-association theory often involved little evidence of actual association with Gülen or individuals or organizations controlled or directed by him.

21. For example, in at least 17 incidents between September 2016 and February 2018, authorities issued detention warrants against more than 650 university personnel. They conducted dozens of raids at locations around the country, detaining more than 500. It appears that the evidentiary bases for these actions included the scholars' use of Bylock (an encrypted smartphone application the government alleged was used by members of the Gülenist movement), possession of an account at Bank Asya (a national banking institution founded by Gülenists and closed by the government following the coup attempt), and possession of US one dollar bills (which authorities allege signifies membership in the Gülenist movement).²⁶

22. Individual scholars prosecuted for alleged ties to the Gülenist movement include:

- **Mehmet Ünlü** a former professor of medicine who was dismissed from his position at Afyon Kocatepe University in September 2016 and charged shortly thereafter with terrorism-related offenses. He was convicted on October 19, 2017, based in significant part on evidence that he had attended Gülen-related

religious gatherings and possessed an account at Bank Asya. He was sentenced to twelve years in prison.²⁷

- **Dr. Sedat Laçiner**, a prominent international relations scholar and former rector of Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University, who was convicted and sentenced to more than nine years in prison on September 25, 2018, on charges of membership in a terrorist organization based on unspecified, alleged connections to Fethullah Gülen.²⁸
- **Serkan Gölge**, a US-Turkish citizen and NASA scientist, who was charged with “membership in a terrorist organization” in the weeks after the coup attempt, apparently based on his having studied at Gülen-affiliated institutions. He was convicted on February 8, 2018. On May 29, 2019, an appeals court upheld his conviction but ordered him released based on time served.²⁹

The State of Emergency

Dismissal of Scholars and Students

23. Although authorities initially claimed that it would last three months, Turkey’s State of Emergency was extended seven times, for additional three-month periods, lasting until July 19, 2018. During this time, the government issued several emergency decrees which, *inter alia*, purged individuals en masse from public sector institutions based on allegations – but little or no publicized evidence – of ties to alleged terrorist organizations.³⁰
24. Higher education was one of the major targets of this effort. In eleven emergency decrees, the government identified 7,508 scholars and university personnel by name,³¹ and ordered them dismissed from their positions and barred permanently from higher education or other civil service work. The government also expelled 301 students from their universities under these decrees.³²
25. On January 23, 2017, in response to substantial public criticism, Turkish authorities issued a decree establishing the State of Emergency Appeals Commission, to allow victims of wrongful dismissals to seek redress. The Commission has been criticized as lacking procedural safeguards, efficiency, structural independence, and transparency.³³
26. Between July 17, 2017, when the first applications were submitted, and the end of 2018, the Commission decided 50,500 cases out of more than 125,000 pending before it.³⁴ Of these, 7.43% of those cases were reportedly decided in favor of the applicants. (It is unclear how many involved higher education personnel.) The Commission does not issue written decisions or explain its legal reasoning,³⁵ in the absence of which it is impossible to understand what standards for evidence or reversal are being applied, and therefore impossible to view the Commission as a viable pathway to relief for scholars, students or others whose rights the state may have violated.

Closure of Universities

27. Immediately following the coup attempt, on July 23, 2016, authorities issued Emergency Decree No. 667, ordering the closure of 15 universities associated with the Gülenist movement.³⁶
28. Consequently, all 2,808 faculty members of these institutions were left jobless, and more than 58,000 students – at a minimum – suffered a severe disruption to their education as they were forced to leave their institutions abruptly without an alternative in place.

Restrictions on Travel

29. The emergency decrees also stripped dismissed scholars of their passports. Under the decrees, nearly 6,000 scholars and 1,300 administrative staff, and their spouses, were barred from leaving Turkey.³⁷ Thus, scholars who have been dismissed from their institutions by government decree are not only unable to attend international conferences and engage with the international academic community, they are wholly prevented from attempting to mitigate the harm they have suffered by restarting their careers abroad.³⁸
30. Termination, exclusion from employment at other institutions or in other civil service spaces, and the loss of the ability to travel to begin a career elsewhere are collectively known as “civil death.”³⁹ They amount to a lifelong punishment that not only destroys academic careers, but effectively prevents those affected from taking employment outside the education sector, severely damaging their livelihoods overall.
31. On July 19, 2018, President Erdoğan ordered Turkey’s State of Emergency lifted. The following week the government passed counter-terrorism legislation that appears to make elements of the State of Emergency permanent.⁴⁰ These include provisions that extend detentions without charge, and permit dismissals of higher education personnel and other civil servants and the cancellation of their passports by decree.⁴¹
32. These arrests, terminations, university closures, expulsions, and related pressures have had a dire impact on the thousands of scholars, students, and higher education personnel that they have targeted directly, and on Turkey’s entire higher education space. A recent study on research outputs by scholars in Turkey, for example, has shown a ~28% decline on average across all disciplines and a ~44% in the social sciences.⁴²

Recommendations to the Turkish Authorities

33. SAR respectfully urges UN member states to call on Turkey to publicly affirm its commitment to academic freedom and related human rights by:
- a. Reversing all charges against, and where applicable, unconditionally releasing from detention, all higher education personnel who have been the subjects of criminal prosecution in retaliation for the nonviolent exercise of academic freedom, freedom of expression, freedom of association, and related rights. These include Peace Petition signatories and those subjected to criminal actions based only on specious allegations of Gülenist associations.
 - b. Pending such actions, ensure that criminal actions proceed in a transparent manner, according to recognized international standards of due process, fair trial and related rights.
 - c. Restore all scholars, students, and higher education personnel who were the subjects of Turkey's emergency decrees to their former university positions.
 - d. Reinstate the passports of all scholars, students, and higher education personnel and their families who were subjected to Turkey's emergency decrees or similar post-State of Emergency provisions.
 - e. Amend, revise, repeal or otherwise ensure that actions under the Anti-Terrorism Law and Article 301, if any, are narrowly construed and consistent with Turkey's obligations under domestic and international law to protect academic freedom and related rights.
34. SAR further respectfully urges member states to protect academic freedom, wherever possible, by extending protections to refugee scholars from Turkey who are within their borders, and allocating available resources to ensure that such scholars are able to continue their academic pursuits while in exile.

¹ R. Quinn and J. Levine, *Intellectual-HRDs & Claims for Academic Freedom Under Human Rights Law*, Int'l J. of Hum. Rts., Dec. 2014, Vol. 18, Issue 7-8, ISBN: 1364-2987, available at <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13642987.2014.976203>.

² For a summary see, Jogchum Vrieling, Paul Lemmens, Stephan Parmentier, "Academic Freedom as a Fundamental Right" (2011) 13 *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences* 117.

³ ECtHR, *Kula v. Turkey*, App. no. 20233/06 (19 June 2018), para. 39.

⁴ Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment No. 13: The Right to Education (Article 13) (8 December 1999), para. 38.

⁵ Committee on Social, Economic and Cultural Rights, General comment No. 21: Right of everyone to take part in cultural life (Article 15, para. 1 (a), of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights) (21 December 2009), paras. 49 (c) and 52(e).

⁶ UNESCO, *Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel*, adopted by the General Conference at its twenty-ninth session, Paris, 21 October - 12 November 1997 (11 November 1997), paras. 18-19.

-
- ⁷ Council of Europe: Parliamentary Assembly (PACE), *Recommendation 1762 (2006)* on “Academic freedom and university autonomy”, adopted on 30 June 2006 at the 23rd Sitting.
- ⁸ Fatma Nevra Seggie and Veysel Gokbel, ‘Academic Freedom in Turkey: from Past to Present’ (June 2014), pp. 18-22.
- ⁹ Article 27, *Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Anayasası* (Constitution of the Republic of Turkey) (1982).
- ¹⁰ <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2013-01-24-na/>
- ¹¹ Turkey’s responses to recommendations (as of 26.08.2015) to the Second UPR Review, Session 21, 2015, Recommendation 148.117 (United States of America). See also Recommendation A-150.52 (Netherlands) (recommending that Turkey “[e]xercise restraint using anti-terrorism legislation in legal procedures against journalists and to ensure the proportionality of measures that limit access to the internet.”) <https://lib.ohchr.org/HRBodies/UPR/Documents/Session21/TR/TurkeyMatriceRecommendations.pdf>.
- ¹² Anti-Terror Law, Article 7 (2).
- ¹³ Venice Commission, Opinion on Articles 216, 299, 301 and 314 of the Penal Code of Turkey, Adopted at the 106th Plenary Session (Venice, 11-12 March 2016), para. 123.
- ¹⁴ Human Rights Foundation of Turkey (HRFT), ‘Academics for Peace: A Brief History’ (15 March 2019), pp. 7 and 16. Amnesty International, ‘Turkey: Decriminalize Dissent: Time to Deliver on The Right to Freedom of Expression’ (27 March 2013), pp. 27-30. Overuse of the provision has triggered criticism by the ECtHR and Venice Commission. ECtHR, *Altuğ Taner Akçam v. Turkey*, App. no. 27520/07 (25 October 2011), para. 93. Venice Commission, Opinion on Articles 216, 299, 301 and 314 of the Penal Code of Turkey, Adopted at the 106th Plenary Session (Venice, 11-12 March 2016), para. 94.
- ¹⁵ Scholars at Risk, ‘Free to Think 2016: Report of the Scholars at Risk Academic Freedom Monitoring Project’ (Free to Think 2016), p. 11, available at <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/resources/free-to-think-2016/>.
- ¹⁶ <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/2016/01/turkish-scholars-detained-and-under-investigation>
- ¹⁷ Amnesty International, ‘Purged Beyond Return? No Remedy for Turkey’s Dismissed Public Sector Workers’ (28 October 2018), pp. 9-10.
- ¹⁸ Scholars at Risk, *Free to Think 2018: Report of the Scholars at Risk Academic Freedom Monitoring Project* (Free to Think 2018), p. 31, available at <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/resources/free-to-think-2018/>.
- ¹⁹ Academics for Peace ‘Three Academics Sentenced to 1 Year, 3 Months in Prison’ (July 1, 2019) available at: <https://www.barisicinakademisyenler.net/node/1308>, last accessed on July 11, 2019.
- ²⁰ See, e.g. <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-04-04-galatasaray-university-istanbul-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-04-05-marmara-university-istanbul-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-04-09-istanbul-university-y%C4%B1ld%C4%B1z-technical-university-van-y%C3%BCz%C3%BCnc%C3%BC-y%C4%B1-technical/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-04-12-istanbul-technical-university-%C3%B6zye%C4%9Fin-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-06-21-marmara-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-07-17-kadir-has-university-koc-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-09-25-bogazici-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-10-17-koc-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-11-28-istanbul-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-12-06-istanbul-bilgi-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2019-01-08-kemerburgaz-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2019-01-17-istanbul-technical-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2019-02-05-istanbul-university-yildiz-technical-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2019-02-26-istanbul-technical-university-bogazici-university-artuklu-university-munzur-university/>; <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2019-03-27-bogazici-university/>
- ²¹ <https://www.barisicinakademisyenler.net/node/1308>, *supra*.
- ²² Space limitations preclude a detailed listing of all cases. However, cases involving detentions or potential detentions of Peace Petition signatories are available at the following web addresses: <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-12-12-galatasaray-university-istanbul-university-istanbul-technical-university-marmara-university/> (Özdemir Aktan, Marmara University – one-year, three-month sentence)

<https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-12-12-galatasaray-university-istanbul-university-istanbul-technical-university-marmara-university/> (Nesrin Sungur Çakmak, Marmara University; Ayşe Erzan, Istanbul Technical University – both received one-year, three-month sentences)

<https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2019-02-21-various-institutions> (Öznur Yaşar Diner, Kadir Has University; Zeynep Tül Süalp, Bahçeşehir University; Esra Kaliber, Bahçeşehir University; Remzi Orkun Güner, Arel University; İlkey Özkuralpli, Arel University; Aysuda Kölemen, Kemerburgaz University; Haydar Durak, Kemerburgaz University; Nihan Aksakallı, Kemerburgaz University; Özgür Müftüoğlu, Kemerburgaz University; Ahmet Bekmen, Kemerburgaz University; İsmet Akça, Yıldız Technical University; Eda Aslı Şeran, Yıldız Technical University; Hülya Kirmanoğlu, İstanbul University; İlkey Yılmaz, İstanbul University – all received two-year, three-month sentences)

<https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2019-03-25-various-institutions/> (S.A., Yalova University – two- year, six-month sentence)

²³ Free to Think 2018, p. 31, *supra*.

²⁴ <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-06-05-marmara-university/>

²⁵ <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2019-01-24-bilgi-university/>

²⁶ <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-09-27-karadeniz-technical-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-10-02-ege-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-10-24-canik-ba%259far%24b1-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-10-26-dokuz-eyl%23%bcl-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-11-18-y%24%b1ld%24b1z-technical-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-01-20-istanbul-technical-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-02-06-istanbul-technical-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-02-24-atat%23%bcrk-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-03-08-anadolu-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-05-05-s%23%bcleyman-sah-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-05-30-dokuz-eyl%23%bcl-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-07-10-turgut-%23%b6zal-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-07-10-bo%24%9fazi%23%a7i-university-istanbul-medeniyet-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-11-17-marmara-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-12-27-fatih-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-12-28-hacettepe-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-02-08-gazi-university/>, <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-03-08-anadolu-university/>

²⁷ <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-10-19-afyon-kocatepe-university/>

²⁸ <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-09-25-canakkale-onsekiz-mart-university/>

²⁹ <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-08-05-nasa-university-houston/>

³⁰ Free to Think 2018, p. 32, *supra*.

³¹ Including at least 407 Peace Petition signatories. Human Rights Watch, ‘Turkey: Government Targeting Academics’ (14 May 2018), available at: <https://www.hrw.org/news/2018/05/14/turkey-government-targeting-academics>.

³² Detailed reports on decrees ordering dismissals from higher education institutions of academic and administrative personnel, as well as students, available at the following addresses: <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-09-01-various> (Decree 672, Sep. 1, 2016, dismissing 2346 academic personnel). <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-09-01-various-institutions>, (Decree 673, Sept 1, 2016, dismissing 158 students). <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-10-29-all-turkish-higher-education-institutions>, (Decree 675, Oct. 29, 2016, dismissing 1,265 academic personnel, 5 administrative personnel, and 68 students) <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-11-22-various-institutions> (Decree 677, Nov. 22, 2016, dismissing 242 academic personnel and 942 administrative personnel) <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-01-06-various-institutions> (Decree 679, Jan. 6, 2017, dismissing 631 academic personnel and 155 administrative personnel) <https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-02-07-various-institutions> (Decree 686, Feb. 7, 2017, dismissing

-
- 330 academic personnel)
<https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-04-29-various-institutions> (Decree 688, Apr. 29, 2017, dismissing 484 academic personnel, 98 administrative personnel, and 59 students)
<https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-07-14-various-institutions> (Decree 692, July 14, 2017, dismissing 302 academic personnel, 54 administrative personnel, and 9 students)
<https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-08-25-various-institutions> (Decree 693, Aug. 25, 2017, dismissing 120 academic personnel and 52 administrative personnel)
<https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2017-12-24-various-institutions> (Decree 695, Dec. 24, 2017, dismissing 105 academic personnel, 50 administrative personnel, and 6 students)
<https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/report/2018-01-12-various-institutions/> (Decree 697, Jan. 12, 2018, dismissing 60 academic personnel and 19 administrative personnel)
<https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/2018/07/turkey-orders-dismissal-of-251-higher-education-personnel/> (Decree 701, Jul. 8, 2018, dismissing 199 academic personnel, 52 administrative personnel, and one student)
- ³³ Amnesty International, ‘Purged Beyond Return? No Remedy for Turkey’s Dismissed Public Sector Workers’ (28 October 2018), pp. 13-17.
- ³⁴ Written Submissions on behalf of the International Commission of Jurists (ICJ) in *Telek and others v. Turkey* case, App. nos. 66763/17, 66767/17 and 15891/18, p. 5.
- ³⁵ Written Submissions on behalf of the International Commission of Jurists (ICJ) in *Telek and others v. Turkey* case, App. nos. 66763/17, 66767/17 and 15891/18, pp. 6-7.
- ³⁶ <http://scholarsatrisk.org/report/2016-07-23-various-institutions>. The universities include: Altın Koza (İpek) University, Bursa Orhangazi University, Canik Başarı University, Selahattin Eyyubi University, Fatih University, Melikşah University, Mevlana University, Şifa University, Turgut Özal University, Zirve University, Kanuni University, İzmir University, Murat Hüdavendigâr University, Gediz University and Süleyman Şah University
- ³⁷ *Free to Think* 2018, p. 37, *supra*.
- ³⁸ Brendan O'Malley, ‘Mass detention and dismissal of academics continues, University World News The Global Window of Higher Education’ (16 January 2018), available at: <https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20180116083248710>.
- ³⁹ <https://www.newsweek.com/arrests-plague-turkey-two-years-after-coup-attempt-1024287>.
- ⁴⁰ Daren Butler and Ali Kucukgocmen, ‘Turkish parliament passes security law to replace emergency rule’, 25 July 2018, available at: <https://af.reuters.com/article/worldNews/idAFKBN1KF0PT>.
- ⁴¹ Human Rights Watch, Turkey: Events of 2018, available at: <https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2019/country-chapters/turkey>.
- ⁴² See Freedom for Academia: 6-month interim report: *The short-term effects of the large-scale purge carried out by the AKP government on the research of Turkey-based academics*. <http://www.freedomforacademia.org/the-short-term-effects-of-the-large-scale-purges-carried-out-by-the-akp-government-on-the-research-output-of-turkey-based-academics-2/>.